



# A Comparative Study of Vidya and Manobi

Kamal Deep Kour

## Abstract:

India, being a cross-cultural country, possesses diverse societies and philosophies. Transgender has a long-standing chronicles in India. They used to partake in a decent position and enhanced different authority posts in India before colonization. However, a great deal of alterations in the existences of transgender was brought by the commencement of colonization in India. They were named and treated as crooks and various regulations were brought against them that ostracized transgender in the public arena. Nonetheless, a beam of expectation for transgender came in via new improvements in India. As an illustration, the decision of Supreme Court in the year 2014, perceived transgender as third-gender and gave reservations to them that appeared promising.

To offer equivalent open door to each resident to develop and accomplish their true capacity, independent of class, religion or sexuality is the core aim of the Indian Constitution. Sexual orientation is possessed by every human being. Male, female and transgender are the main three orientations seen in India. Since the Transgender group is a piece of the sociable structure, they have an equivalent right in all that is accessible to all others on the planet. As already stated above, the presence of transgender is pre-owned and is carved in history from days of yore. Transgender in antiquity had a say and were included in the general public, however there has been great deal of mutations in the same and they are subject to segregation and harassment. The prejudice faced by them has been a lasting issue and has simply shown to be less accepted with the length of time and this discrimination in view of their group and orientation make them one of the most frail class that Indian Society exhibits. The earliest transgender self-portrayal of India by **Living Smile Vidya** "I'm Vidya" and history of India's earliest Transgender Principal **Manobi Bandyopadhyay** "A Gift of Goddess Lakshmi" are covered in the comparative study of this paper.

Keywords: Transgender, Hijra, Gender, Colonization, Marginalization

## Introduction:

Sex and gender are for the most part utilized as exchangeable terms. Notwithstanding, these terms vary from one another. Though sex of an individual is natural, sexual orientation and gender are socially developed. The general public chooses the jobs for every orientation and anticipates that they should act as needs be and the individuals who act diversely to their orientation are considered as eccentric or queer. Sexual orientation contrasts for every individual. The feeling of individuals as male or female is for the most part characterized as sexual orientation, in conjunction with individuals' existence as male or female. When the sexual orientation doesn't coordinate with the organic sex, people are termed as transgender. In simpler terms, the condition of one's "sexual orientation" not matching one's "birth sex" is known as transgender (Golden Kisha 2013).

Just two polarities or genders in light of the genitalia at the hour of birth are recognised by our general public and they are male and female through the assignment of sex. It occurs even before birth in the mother's womb basing on the outer genitalia. In any case, there are a few exclusions where the new-born children won't be quickly

distinguished as male or female in live births. In such cases sex chromosomes, outer genitalia and inward regenerative framework don't affirm to the males and females and they are called as intersexual. Such intersexual are considered as third orientation or transgender where they don't have a place with one or the other sexual orientation that is predominantly accepted by the society.

The term 'transgender' alludes to mean people who go past unbending, fabricating double sexual orientations. Such obstruction is worked with through the breaking and obscuring of socially predominant cliché set of culturally defined behaviours. Impotent men having a long history that traces all the way back to 9th Century B.C are for the most part known as 'Third Gender'. These recently maimed men were typically utilized in royal quarters for ladies as watchmen. Under the sphere of Article 21, the option to pick one's sexual orientation is a fundamental part to lead an existence with respect. The *right to gender identity* has been given by the court to the individuals of India. A wide scope of characters, appearances, and ways of behaving is incorporated by the term transgender that befogs or crosses the lines of sexual orientation.

Nevertheless, in our social orders, the presence of third orientation and its personality is enormously ignored. Particularly, in Indian culture either male or female is considered as expected and any person or thing that is other than male or female is considered queer or infrahuman, implying that they are not fully humans, rather on a lower degree. Social development of gender as well as the sexual contrast acts as a major part of the proceedings of sexual orientation. Unexpectedly, social development of orientation, particularly in Indian culture is bound to one or the other male or female and the third orientation is disregarded and besides minimized and offended 100% of the time. To merely recognize the third orientation in our society takes a ton of boldness and fortitude. It is an exceptionally normal sight at railway stations and at traffic lights where the transgender are segregated and are kept away from. According to the much prevalent belief system, "Their touch contaminates and their condemnations work out as expected."

Notwithstanding, the presence of third orientation or transgender in India is definitely not another peculiarity. As already highlighted, they have a long-standing antiquity in India.

**Hijras'** were once a worshipped and acknowledged bunch in Indian culture. The eunuchs and characters with both male and female attributes are incorporated by the Vedas, old Hindu scripts. Good fortune and unique power of prolificacy was believed to be brought in by them... At weddings and births, they have performed 'badhai' (greetings) or favors for quite a long time. (DelliSwararaos 2016) Be that as it may, they are maintained at a protected separation and are not permitted to blend with others. As it were, they are treated as untouchables.

In diverse parts of India, multiple titles have been given to the transgender community. *Hijras, eunuchs, tirunangais, khoja, aravanis* are some of the epithets that they are referred with and they had been important for Indian culture for a time immemorial. In the legendary texts of the land 'Ramayana' and 'Mahabharata', their existence can be affirmed. There were verifiable proof of acknowledgment of "third-sex" or people not affirm to male or female orientation in close to the starting compositions of antiquated India. The idea of "*tritiyakriti*" or "*napumsaka*" had been a vital piece of the Hindu folklore, old stories, epic and early Vedic and Puranic writing (Michelraj 2015).

In the courts of Mughals, transgender community was treated well. Shrewd, reliable and savagely steadfast was what "hijras" were thought of as and had free admittance to all spaces and areas of the populace, there by assuming an essential part in the legislative issues of realm working in the Mughal time (Michelraj 2015). However, the destiny of transgender community met serious alterations in India as the British appeared that made them one of the survivors of colonization. Every one of the recipients that they had appreciated till then, plundered them by the English. The hijras were despised greatly by the British and so they couldn't stand the significance given to them by the Indian rulers. Consequently, they were deprived of social equality and people begun overwhelmingly condemn the community of hijra.

An alternate disposition towards the transgender community was brought in by the colonization. They were mistreated, became a subject of social abuse and the steady criticizing of their body and propensities prompted a mental injury. Oppressive comments were tossed upon them by the general populace and, surprisingly, the family reprimanded them. In India, the current status of transgender community is wretched. (Subapriya 2016)

A gathering of transgender or hijras, clad in customary sarees or chudidars, forcefully asking money from individuals, applauding and favoring the individuals who offer them cash and reviling the people who deny is an exceptionally normal sight in Indian railroads and at many traffic lights of metropolitan urban communities.

Then again, as they have no other occupation other than prostitution or beggary, numerous hijras or people from the community of transgender are either constrained or chipped in into prostitution. Due to spurning orientation standards, rustic transgender or hijra segments are marginalized and are also likewise mistreated by standing and class pecking orders, which cross with gendered abuse to intensify their debilitation inside friendly designs. Transgender community is seen from the perspective of a vagabond or streetwalkers by a considerable bunch of people and a very little consideration is paid to their grim lives.

## Description of Vidya and Manobi :

However, a small percentage of transgender community figured out to move up in the society of India in such unfavourable and pugnacious lay of the land. Every time they confronted embarrassment and dismissal, they stood unwavering and even more determined and firm. Living smile *Vidya* and *Manobi Bandyopadhyay* are two among the community of transgender, who substantiated themselves to the scary society.

An Indian trans-woman, entertainer, collaborator chief and essayist from Chennai, Living Smile *Vidya*, otherwise called, *Smiley* is a transgender lobbyist and blogger who holds a post-advanced education in Applied Etymology from the Tanjavuru College. She began her vocation as an electronic information handling collaborator and consequently turned into the first trans-woman in India who worked in a standard occupation instead of working for NGOs. Later she moved to a theatre, the beneficiary of the lofty English Gathering - Charles Wallace India Trust Association to study theatre in the UK. She acted in a few short movies, including *Kandal Pookkal* and *500&5*. She likewise acted in narrative movies "*Aghrinaigal*" and "*Butterfly*". She was the subject of the honor winning Kannada narrative "*Naanu Avanalla . . . Avalu*", in light of her personal history.

The book is her self-portrayal that is examined in this paper. Written in Tamil, her self-portrayal "*I'm Vidya: A Transgender Journey*" was subsequently converted into seven unique dialects including English. First distributed in 2007, it is amongst the most splendid Transgender diaries. It is the first transgender personal history in Quite a while. The battle of Sarvanan to become *Vidya* is featured via this book. A great deal of physical and mental preparation is incorporated in the battle. Along with her life, the predicament of contemporary Transgender like *Vidya* in India is additionally portrayed through this personal history.

*Manobi Bandyopadhyay* is the first transsexual head in Quite a while. She was brought into the world on 23 September 1964 as *Somnath Bandyopadhyay*. She turned into India's first third-orientation (transsexual) head at Krishnanagar Ladies' School in Naihati locale in West Bengal on 9 June 2015. She was chosen for this post absolutely on merit. She holds a Ph.D. in Bengali Writing and was beforehand an academic administrator of Bengali at the Vivekananda Satavarshiki Mahavidyalaya in Jhargram. In 1995 she began the principal Bengali transsexual magazine, *Abomanob* meaning infrahuman. There are two books surprisingly. The first *Ontohin Ontorin Prositovortika* (*Unending Subjugation*) which is a blockbuster. The other one is written in Bengali titled *Third Gender*.

*A Gift of Goddess Lakshmi*, a forthright life-story of *Manobi Bandyopadhyay* composed by a Journalist, *Jhimli Mukherjee Pandey* is the work that is talked about in this paper. As *Manobi* recounts her account of change from a man into a lady with resolute genuineness and profound agreement, it is called as an open account of India's First Transgender principal by the authors. The birth and life of *Somanath* and his excursion to become *Manobi* and the difficulties she looked all through the excursion and how she kept on seeking after scholastics regardless of numerous disturbances is portrayed via this work. The excursion of a transgender to characterize her personality and set new norms of accomplishment is rather phenomenal and bold. Our general public and its treatment and response to the transgender community in our general public is extremely well reflected in this book.

# *Comparative analysis of “I am vidya” and “A Gift of Goddess Lakshmi” :*

Two unique ways to progress of two transgender is shown in both *I am Vidya* and *A Gift of Goddess Lakshmi*. Because of absence of help from the family, an MA language specialist graduate Vidya, needed to leave everything and went to Pune to ask and procure as a hijra for the medical procedure of her sex reassignment. However, Manobi never had to leave her schooling as she was honored to have her folks who never abandoned her and subsequently found a new line of work to procure for the medical procedure of her sex reassignment medical procedure. A great deal of data about the inner and outer chaos and battle of transgender community is portrayed via both of these books. These written accounts make it easier for us to apprehend the existence of transgender community and their anguish.

*A Gift of Goddess Lakshmi* introduces Manobi as Somanath as the book commences whilst on the other hand Vidya's self-portrayal is commenced with her subsequent birth - birth as a lady, birth as Vidya by dint of 'Nirvana' (Medical procedure of Sex Reassignment). Concentrating on these two texts, a considerable number of subtleties can be drawn of transgender community and the lives they lead.

The lives of Vidya and Manobi have a lot in common. As an illustration, both of them are the single male child to their parents after girls and were both treasured and spoiled proudly. Furthermore, the ordinary Indian attitude of bearing a male kid as an accomplishment is portrayed by the written accounts of both. As stated by Vidya in her self-portrayal, to compensate for two young ladies and the deficiency of his firstborn child, her dad was anticipating the following child to be a boy.....Ultimately when they arrived at the Vayalur Murugan Temple in Tiruchi, he pledged that if the next child they bear would be a baby boy, he'll be named after Murugan (the managing deity). He would likewise shave his head in a devout oblation of his devotion to the almighty. (Vidya 2007)

The treatment she used to get from people, specifically her family as he was a boy, is shared by Vidya in this book. She was never permitted by the father to accomplish any work at home and was consistently advised that being the male beneficiary of their family, he ought to simply study. She adds that amongst all the members of the family, she was an advantaged one. She was the only one among the three kids who didn't have to accomplish any household chores and that was the unwritten regulation.... The reason to the point of absolving her from work of any sort was simply that he was the male beneficiary of the family!..... She furthermore shared that by uprightness of a kid, she was the sole recipient of all the adoration and love at home (Vidya 2007).

The appearance of Manobi as well was highly celebrated by his dad for a reason that he too was the only male kid of her parents. In reference to her words, her dad, Chittaranjan Bandyopadhyay, was a pleased and the most happiest man that day as after two little girls, he finally met his dream to bear a baby boy.... The family that had mocked him his entire life for not having the privilege to bear a baby boy, now witnessed him parading and bragging the crown of being a father to a male kid at last. He named her after one of the lord Shiva's several names, Somnath, as he believed that he was a blessing tossed upon them by Lord Shiva. (Vidya 2007)

Much like Vidya's sisters, Manobi's sisters were so terrified of their dad as well. Since his father was never harsh on her, Manobi probably never had a reason to fear her father. She raises a question by saying that was it on the grounds that she was a male child? And even exclaimed the treasured position of a young male in a family. (Vidya 2007). In Indian culture how young men are given significance and are dealt with better than their young lady kin are portrayed through these occurrences. The normal outlook of our Indian's giving superior place to men in a society right from the very birth is portrayed real well by the means of these books.

Furthermore, Vidya and Manobi felt the change at an early days of their childhood when they were merely six or seven years old. With their adoration for their sisters printed gowns and skirts, their change was commenced. To be a complete woman was the profound longings of the both. Not only this but also their sex organs were highly despised by the both of them. They were so fascinated by the women clothing that they started putting on the clothes of their sister in private and spent their time dancing to the tunes of film melodies. The love of films was also something that the two of them had in common and they were personally impacted a lot by the courageous women they used to see on screen. They used to impersonate female celebrities at school and get a decent, hail for

their copying abilities. Yet, the two of them knew deep down that they were being their self in doing as such and not impersonating anyone.

They hated to be called as young men and wished to yell and tell the whole world around them that they were women and not men that people have perceived them to be. Liberal arts and humanities was what the both of them had an exceptionally profound interest in. Dramatization gatherings is what Vidya used to work with while Manobi with dance gatherings. Vidya, even today, is a renowned stage performer.

In any act or stage drama, female characters were ideally picked by them with the goal that they would be able flaunt their feminity with next to no feeling of dread towards being caught as one in real and to fulfil the desire of displaying their actual self to all. Vidya shared with the readers that all things considered, she was professing to impersonate a young lady merely for kicks, but her act was exceptionally enjoyed by them, however somewhere inside she was not exactly acting and rather communicating her inward desires (Vidya 2007). Similarly, when the same happened with Somnath, the professor took her exemplary act as a paradigm and told everyone out there that in the event that he, being a boy can mimic a young lady so well, why can't they do the same...?! On this, she grinned modestly and partook in the applause when what she really wanted to do is to tell everyone that she wasn't making an effort to be a young lady but rather she was really one. (Bandyopadhyay 2017)

Apart from the similarities discussed above, their lives go endlessly parallel to one another. Dance was one such thing that they had crazy passion about and were enthusiastically into it. Manobi had a belief that for a transgender community, dance falls into place without a hitch. According to him, the two fields in which transgendered people dominate the rest is unquestionably dance and makeup (Bandyopadhyay 2017). They stood against the societal norms and denied to take the prodding or unforgiving remarks on their feminity and rather felt blissful being perceived as a female. Academically, the two of them were extremely splendid and yet met unpleasant encounters in their schools. They hated the male clothing but also had a realization that adorning clearly ladylike clothing could create a mess and cause issues and so they decided to get androgynous garments(Vidya 2007). The college days were the most joyful and best for the both of them considering that their sexuality wasn't disapproved by anyone and were never provoked by people around them in campus for their feminity. They worked under press is also something that they had in common apart from their lifestyle. They generally attempted to stifle their feminity before others and put themselves out there in isolation. To whoever they shared their plight with, they exhorted by most of them to not consider the medical procedure of Sex Reassignment.

Yet, the desire to lay out their sexuality remained a higher priority than anything for the both of them. Manobi added that the greatest point of her life was to lay out her sexual character (Bandyopadhyay 2017) Unpleasant was the internal mental disturbances and chaos that they went through in the process of getting their real identity acknowledged and respected. A ton of stress was tossed upon them by the dread of the general public of segregation and objection that eventually caused serious injury to their mental health. The life lead by them was a twofold ride until they went through the medical procedure of Sex Reassignment. At first they were mistaken and bemused of their sexuality, yet the feminity in them broke every one of the questions and headed on to the journey to lay out their sexuality even at the expense of their demise, they longed to bring out their true self.

Be that as it may, the ways Vidya and Manobi took to lay out their personality through a medical procedure of sex reassignment were disparate. Being a degree holder in MA Linguistics, Vidya had no other choice but to join the community of transgender in Pune and perform beggary in the roads and trains to bring in the cash for the medical process of her sex reassignment. Vidya confronted a ton of physical and mental injury all through her life as a tirunangai (an epithet by which transgender are referred to in Tamil Nadu). The segregation and marginalization from the general public is what mainly caused the injury. Initially, in the process to clap and ask for money in streets, all her confidence and education became a collateral damage. Beggary was her only choice as she pledged and was determined never to be a sex-worker. (Vidya 2007)

Vidya shared that she was in a stew to beg in the shop even when her mind advised her hands to connect, the hands would not comply! Tears were gushing in her eyes. It was at that exact moment that she recalled her MA Linguistics, everything being equal. She remained there, apprehensive, reluctant. (Vidya 2007)

Even the medical process of her sex reassignment was not an endorsed technique or even sterile. The medical procedure of her sex reassignment was termed by her as 'nirvana' the ultimate peace - the inward harmony that comes from turning into an actual lady by eliminating male sex organs. A simple butchering of the male privates was the process is what Vidya shared. Be that as it may, it was no activity theatre, as soon as she stepped into the

small room, she understood it was a slaughterhouse (Vidya 2007). She says that the dividers of the room dispensed for transgenders in the emergency clinic was full with the jotting of their names on the divider and it was since that they dreaded they would kick the bucket on the activity table. The most perilous conditions transgender in India go through in the process of laying out their sexuality can be affirmed through this very thing. There could have been no legitimate lawful emergency clinics to perform the surgery and most of the transgenders know nothing about them, despite the fact that there are a few. After the successful technique, Vidya felt so assuage and cheerful like never before. Her actual agony was overpowered by her inward harmony. (Vidya 2007)

In reference to the words of Vidya, a sense of contentment was achieved by her internally that day. It was a tremendous alleviation. She was extremely ecstatic of the fact that she, finally, is a woman, that she, at last possessed a female body.... She felt much obliged to them for eliminating her masculinity from her body and was gratified for making her body of a female that eventually caused her life's ultimate satisfaction. On the off chance that she meets her demise anytime after her transformation, she said that she'll die happily as she exhibits nothing to loose anymore. She added that now she can rest in harmony. (Vidya 2007)

Manobi was sufficiently fortunate to have a sympathetic and supportive family in juxtaposition to Vidya. However, the family sure didn't uphold her for her decision to go under surgery for Sex Reassignment yet they had never abandoned her and generally put her on right education. In reference to her words, she said that she perceives herself as definitely luckier than other from the same community in numerous ways.... She added that only God knows where she would have ended up wounded if only her family had not upheld her notwithstanding her 'peculiarity' and constrained her to dominate in studies (Bandyopadhyay 2017).

In a far off town of Jhargram, her schooling found her a line of work as a teacher. In any case, it was anything but a walk in the park for her as the majority of her associates abhorred her colloquialism that nobody as modest as a hijra ought to be permitted to educate in a school, share something similar staffroom, rest rooms, and offices (Bandyopadhyay 2017). She was continually attacked by them and was affronted from time to time.

In any case, Manobi kept her calm and never abandoned them, rather stood her position and proceeded with her work. India's first transgender magazine was commenced by her that she titled as *Abomanob* that refers to subhuman. The medical procedure of her sex reassignment was a long interaction where she got the ideals of advising from psychoanalysts and therapists. Prior the medical procedure, she went under hormonal treatment for certain years. The medical process of her sex reassignment medical did not simply involved removing the male sex organs, but rather a plastic specialist effectively shaped her bosoms and had the option to make the ideal female genitalia for her. She said that Somnath had left her forever and now Manobi is conceived, similarly as Dr Khanna had written in the testament.... Eventually, her spirit had tracked down its body, and she had a feeling of fulfilment that had been denied to her upon entering the world (Bandyopadhyay 2017).

In any case, even after the successful surgery of their sex transformation, their lives were no better than how they used to lead previously. They were still considered to be an abnormality by the general public and were continuously provoked by them with jeers and remarks. There was no clue of peace and harmony left even for their families and became a subject of harassment by the neighbours. It was required of both of them to contend energetically with the states to change their names and sex in the records. A ton of battles were required to be setup by Vidya to amend her name from Sarvanan to Vidya and likewise, Manobi to amend her name from Somnath to Manobi.

## Conclusion:

India is a place that exhibits diversity in societies and customs. Regardless of whether acknowledged Hijras or transgenders are a very vital piece of our way of life, it's about time we leave the shame about them and teach them in the standard society. A great deal of inside data about transgenders and their mental and actual agony is portrayed by the present transgender personal history and memoir. Incorporating such writings for transgenders in our standard schooling may lead the understudies to comprehend them and their plight in a better manner and empathize with them. Right after the Supreme Court judgment in 2015, asking the government to give reservation

## **Citations:**

1. *Living Smile Vidya – Wikipedia*
2. *CommunitySpeak >> I am Vidya – Yokibu (book review)*
3. Manobi Bandyopadhyay – Wikipedia
4. Latha Anantharaman reviews A Gift of Goddess Lakshmi - The Hindu
5. Vidya, Living Smile. I am Vidya. New Delhi: Rupa Publications, 2007.
6. Making Her-story: Review of A Gift of Goddess Lakshmi, Manobi Bandyopadhyay's memoir (Hindustan Times, 2017)
7. “The plight of Transgender community in India” – The Law Gurukul (Jhanvi Sharma)

