



An analytical review; Mistakes of Imitating the ideology of western psychotherapists and its negative effect on Indian Subjects;

Author; Arjun Singh

M.Sc

Psychotherapists imitate the ideology of western therapists and apply it to Indian patients without considering the facts that Indians are very different in thinking, behaviour, ideology, and acceptance. I have analysed the issues and found the same arbitrary and unacceptable in Indian prospect. The discussion on two issues are analysed in this article. The first one is to motivate the Indian Patient to be non-judgmental and the second one is to feed them with the idea of self-love.

Forcing non-judgmental behaviour.

The first one, Indian therapists, emphasize the idea of non-judgmental behaviour and action. They press the subject to think without any prejudice and bias. They themselves claim that they are immune from personal prejudice and bias, and their diagnosis and treatment resulted from their professional judgement only. However, being local, Indian therapists are themselves live in the shell of Indian ideology but try to act like western therapists. Indian therapists forget the facts that Indians (and some other Asian countries) have bigger circle to live with others and coexist collectively in the same space. Co-existence gives them more right to interfere in other's life, and they rightfully tend to judge the others and act accordingly. The Indian society is not an individualistic like western societies but a collectivist society. Indians have birth rights to judge others and act accordingly. For example, Indians have obligations since birth i.e. share personal things with siblings, they look after each other, to care each other, likewise, children have to obey parents without questions, to look after them in the old age, parents have to decide future of children even in many cases, marriages and life partners of a person are decided by parents and relatives.

In the Collectivist societies, a person is developed with the fulfilment of his or her needs by the family and society. In reciprocal, he or she fulfils the desires and needs of other persons. The people in the collectivist societies are not self-centred. Their goals are collectively decided by the group. They learn social values that revolve around what is best for a family, group, community and society.

What Indians learn since birth by virtue of family, friends and community is subject of deep investigation and therapy should be based on the result of such investigation. As psychotherapy is new field in India in comparison with Western countries and behaviour and action of the subject may be different due to cultural and social difference. No major research in the contexts of psychology of Indian patients and western patients is available. No such analysis of reactions of the patients on the same advice or therapy as applied by the western therapist has been examined, therefore, there is no certainty that Indian patients will have the similar effect. Some therapists are naive and copying the procedure of therapy from western world without knowing the truth that Indian patients may have different impacts. Children sleeping with parents

or grandparents, in the same room, up to many years are very common in India which is not a characteristic of western society. Thus, a child suffering from nightmares in India is not basically from being alone in the night, but it can be possible in western countries.

Some researchers have examined the same and extracts of the same are being reproduced which shows the same Conclusions.

“..... In individualistic societies, where individuals strive for personal independence, personally organized behaviors reflect one's feelings, thoughts and decisions (Markus and Kitayama, 1991). For instance, taking care of elderly parents is considered the "birth duty" of a son in Indian culture, whereas it is considered an expression of "gratitude" in American culture that a son might or might not exhibit (Miller and Luthar, 1989). Generally, North American and Western European societies are considered individualistic, while Hispanic, Asian and some Eastern cultures are considered collectivistic (Bontempo et al., 1990). ...”

“.....Whereas Hindu-Indians based their prosocial behaviors on a sense of duty, US-Americans described their prosocial behaviors in terms of personal choice (Miller & Bersoff, 1992; Miller & Luthar, 1989). Thus, given a particular situation, Hindu-Indians were more likely to understand their prosocial interventions in terms of an obligation, whereas US-Americans were more likely to interpret their prosocial responses as relying on the personal decision of each individual.”

In an essay on social psychology, Kendra Cherry correctly describes the difference between individualistic and collectivist societies.

“In individualistic cultures, people are considered "good" if they are strong, self-reliant, assertive, and independent. This contrasts with collectivist cultures where characteristics like being self-sacrificing, dependable, generous, and helpful to others are of greater importance.”

Indian therapists apply the ingredients of western societies to diagnose the problems of Indian patients and act accordingly. Being judgemental may or may not affect the Mental Health of western individuals, but it may be the duty of the Indians. In the contexts of individualistic society, it is easy to say that being judgement can increase mental problems like depression, anxiety etc. of a person but judging others can be moral, ethical and social duty of an Indian patient which patient is used to. In India, judging others and act accordingly may be constructive and positive with the mental satisfaction that may have positive effect on mental health.

Motivating Self-Love

As per general definition, self-love consists of the qualities of having trust, confidence, and pride in yourself and your abilities.

Practicing self-love means setting boundaries, being mindful, and removing toxic people from your life. It is a simple fact that Indians are more dedicated to family members and neighbours. Indians love family members more than themselves. A father is happier to see success of his son instead of him. The same is not a main feature of western societies. In India, a woman is more dedicated to her family than to herself. Such type of traits of culture make the India a unique country and people having some deviations from Cultural traits does not constitute it western country. Indian therapists want them to convert into the person

of different ideology which is not suitable from the Indian perspective and that decreases satisfaction which further creates depression and anxiety. The “Gita”, most famous holy book of India, motivate the people to love all people and indulge in public welfare for peace of mind and satisfaction. The idea of self-love is not only selfish, but enhance narcissistic behaviour. Some Indians already influenced from western culture or therapists copying the western ideology are freak about self-love while there is difference between western and Indians culture and thought. India, being a collectivist society, emphasizes on making bond with family and relative and love them which is priority for every Indian. On the other hand, self-love and self-focus make a western person comfortable.

It is a well known fact that Therapists always advise the patients to love himself In whatever conditions which is truly harmful to patients and his family, relatives, friends and other connected people. As Harriet Frew, an eating disorder therapist and member of the British Association of Counselling and Psychotherapy (BACP), explains,

“.....forcing self-loving thoughts, behaviours or feelings when you’re feeling kind of crap can actually be super harmful. As Frew puts it, toxic-self love can be reductive because “it glosses over deeper emotions and needs, and can also bring about a sense of isolation and disconnection from others. It’s hard to determine when exactly toxic self-love became such a big part of our lives....”307307

Research suggests that developing self-esteem may generally be positive but still mixed. High self-esteem individuals may be resistant to negative experiences of love sickness. However, they may also miss the highs associated with manic love. In sum, the ego can be as much of a hindrance to romantic relationships as it can be a help. Individuals looking to experience love may be best served by turning out toward the other rather than turning in toward the self.

In Indian culture, some people influenced by western ideas enhance self-involvement against the culture, ethics and moral values of Indian Society. Due to bearing a high level of breakable or shallow pride, that may be supported by the valueless compliments of self. Furthermore, studies have shown that overdone self-love and exaggerated self-esteem are repeatedly followed by cynicism, an indisposition, verbal defensiveness, and, in few circumstances, aggression. It is also seen that some people hide their frustrations, failures and loneliness behind the concept of hollow self-esteem and unfruitful self-centred love. Due to this psychology, they are unable to love and difficult to be loved.

Conclusion

It is not necessary that all the aspects of western psychotherapy are applicable in Indian context. Being non-judgemental and loving self are aspects which may have positive effect on the western subject, but the same may or may not be effective in Indian context. In an absolute and unbiased functionality of therapy, the Indian patients may be seen from different angle by considering the facts and circumstances. Whether being Judgemental and real low self-esteem is the root cause of problems? Whether patient has obligations to judge and love others and act accordingly? **Whether** there is apparent difference being normal judgements and biased judgement? **Whether** patient is prejudice by behaviour or action or both? **Whether** patient’s biased and prejudiced judgement is coming from mental instability or it is a result of his experience? **Whether** patient is non-committal to self-love? **Whether** low self-esteem is really existed or problems are hidden in other causes? It is, therefore, a necessity in Indian scenario that any therapy may be applied after examining the elements and differences between western and Indian Society.

References.

1. *Issues of Interpersonal Responsibility and Accountability: A Comparison of Indians' and Americans' Moral Judgments*

September 1989 *Social Cognition* 7(3):237-261 DOI: 10.1521/soco.1989.7.3.237

Authors: Joan G. Miller and Sunanda Luther unrestricted availability on [researchgate.net](https://www.researchgate.net)

2. *Cultures and Behaviour* by Kendra Cherry **Medically reviewed by Amy Morin, LCSW** unrestricted availability on www.verywellmind.com